Seven Models of Discipline

DEVELOPING A DISCIPLINE PLAN FOR YOU
Thomas H. Allen, Ph.D.

(c) 1996. All rights reserved. Fair use by teachers and students is authorized. Commercial use is prohibited except by prior written permission by the author

If you are to teach successfully, you must have the circumstances that make it possible for you to teach and for your pupils to learn. Those circumstances do not happen by accident. You need to develop a plan to ensure that reasonable circumstances for teaching and learning do occur. Each teacher, class, subject, and situation is different. No plan will fit every situation. The purpose of this text (and the Classroom Management Workshop it was designed to supplement) is to help you develop a discipline plan for your class; to know how to diagnose problems; and to know how to change the plan to fit changed situations.

Prior to 1970 there were no systematic classroom control models. Schools of education gave random good advice...much of which was useful. In the early 1960's, our societies' conventions and the schools started to come unglued. Teachers had previously been able to maintain order by asserting their authority. Pupils generally were reasonably well behaved and rarely required much disciplinary attention from the teacher. The old methods began to fail.

Teachers typically do the best that they know how to do. Some have discipline problems. Many of the teachers currently in the schools have not received systematic help to this day. Unless their school has brought in a workshop presenter, it is unlikely that they have had systematic instruction in developing a discipline plan for their classes.

In the decade from 1969 to 1979, a number of models were developed to deal with the fact that teachers all over the country were complaining that they could no longer teach effectively because of classroom disruption and student inattention.

A number of researchers observed the teaching of many instructors. They noted what worked and what didn't work. They developed systematic ways to deal with the problems of class control. Several of these systematic models are given in brief form here.

The descriptions of the following models have been digested by Tom Allen and modified to fit his own experience, other sources and workshops with such presenters as Lee Canter and Fred Jones. The models are summarized from Building Classroom Discipline: From Models to Practice, by C.M. Charles, Longman: New York, 1985. Charles has summarized seven systematic models of classroom management. Each of these has elements that you may find appropriate now or in the future. The models are based on extensive observation of pupil and teacher behavior and on research into various psychological aspects of human nature and behavior. They incorporate what is deemed to work in the hands of successful teachers.

The plan of this class is to work through the available options and develop a plan that will make it possible for you to teach and the pupils to learn...and for you to feel comfortable with what you do to make it possible.

Annual polls of beliefs about the schools consistently rate the lack of discipline at the top of the list of problems. Teachers and the general public agree on this. Even pupils agree that the lack of classroom discipline is the main problem. One poll found that 9 out of 10 teachers complained that student misbehavior interfered with their teaching.

Although fear of physical attack is common, serious injury of teachers is very rare. Verbal encounters with hostile students are more common. Violence among pupils and vandalism are common. But what is disrupting classes is relatively innocuous. Fred Jones researched the
problem and found that about 99% of the typically encountered discipline problems are made up of such behaviors as pupils talking without permission, daydreaming, wandering around the room, or otherwise not doing what they have been asked to do.

If Jones is correct— that nearly all of what bugs teachers is no more significant than goofing off, why all the concern? This low level misbehavior interferes with teaching and learning. It is a heavy contributor to stress and "burn-out." The need to deal constantly with noisy, disorderly, and discourteous behavior...and the occasionally serious confrontation with defiant behavior...wears teachers down. It is to deal with these routine distractions and to reduce the likelihood for confrontations that systematic classroom control models have been developed. Although significant elements of various models have been presented here, the rationales and examples have been generally omitted due to space limitations. The selections were made to give an idea of the range of options open to the teacher...if you want to know more about one or more of the models consult Building Classroom Discipline: From Models to Practice, by C.M. Charles, Longman: New York, several editions, or look up works by the authors of the individual models. When funding permits, the TPSS Program offers TPSS 701 Assertive Discipline and TPSS 701 Classroom management Techniques. These workshops, taught by local public school educators who have been trained by Lee Canter or Fred Jones, are highly recommended.

Underlying all discipline problems and efforts to cope with misbehavior are four basic realities of human nature: We tend to resist doing what others try to make us do; we like to denigrate and "question authority"; every person is different in interests, abilities and learning styles as well as different needs, wants and values; and, as children grow older, they need to be weaned psychologically in order to develop their potential. The ultimate goal should be to develop self-discipline in pupils and to move away from external, authority-imposed control; in the meanwhile, a systematic control system makes it possible for teachers to teach and pupils to learn. This teacher-imposed plan should provide for a transition to self-control and should wither away as it is no longer needed.

**KEY IDEAS OF SEVEN MODELS OF DISCIPLINE**

The Kounin Model: Withitness, Alerting, and Group Management.

- The ripple effect: when you correct one pupil's behavior, it tends to change the behavior of others.
- The teacher needs to be with it to know what is going on everywhere in the room at all times.
- Smooth transitions between activities and maintaining momentum are key to effective group management.
- Optimal learning takes place when teachers keep pupils alert and held accountable for learning.
- Boredom [satiation] can be avoided by providing variety to lessons, the classroom environment and by pupil awareness of progress.

The Neo-Skinnerian Model: Shaping Desired Behavior. B.F. Skinner is the father of the behavioral school of psychology. A recently popular outgrowth of Skinnerian behaviorism is Behavior Modification. For a useful presentation, see the section on the Behavioral Systems Family in Joyce and Weil, Models of
Teaching, particularly the introduction to the section and chapters on "Learning Self-Control" and "Assertive Training."

- Behavior is conditioned by its consequences. Behavior is strengthened if followed immediately by reinforcement. Behavior is weakened if it is not reinforced. ["Extinction."] Behavior is also weakened if it is followed by punishment.
- In the beginning stages of learning, reinforcement provided every time the behavior occurs produces the best results.
- Behavior can be maintained by irregular reinforcement. Reinforcers include verbal approval, smiles, "thumbs up," high grades, free reading time, goodies, prizes and awards.

The Ginott Model:
Addressing the Situation with Sane Messages.
- Discipline is little-by-little, step-by-step. The teacher's self-discipline is key. Model the behavior you want in students.
- Use sane messages when correcting misbehavior. Address what the student is doing, don't attack the student's character [personal traits]. Labeling disables.
- Use communication that is congruent with student's own feelings about the situation and themselves.
- Invite cooperation rather than demanding it.
- Teachers should express their feelings--anger--but in sane ways. "What you are doing makes me very angry. I need you to ...."
- Sarcasm is hazardous.
- Praise can be dangerous; praise the act, not the student and in a situation that will not turn peers against the pupil.
- Apologies are meaningless unless it is clear that the person intends to improve.
- Teachers are at their best when they help pupils develop their self-esteem and to trust their own experience.

The Glasser Model:
Good Behavior Comes from Good Choices. Glasser's recent work focuses on the class meeting as a means of developing class-wide discipline. See the chapter on The Classroom Meeting in Joyce and Weil, Models of Teaching. [For those who have their classes under control and would like to try to go beyond teacher-imposed discipline, William Glasser's approach is worth serious consideration.
- Students are rational beings capable of controlling their own behavior.
- Help pupils learn to make good choices, since good choices produce good behavior.
- Do not accept excuses for bad behavior. Ask, "What choices did you have? Why did you make that choice? Did you like the result? What have you learned?"
- Reasonable consequences should always follow good or bad student behavior.
  - [Usually developed in classroom meetings,] class rules are essential to a good learning climate, they must be enforced.
  - Classroom meetings are a good way to develop and maintain class behavior. [The group diagnoses the problem and seeks solutions.]

The Dreikurs Model:
Confronting Mistaken Goals.
- Discipline is not punishment. It means self-control.
• The teacher's role is helping pupils to impose limits on themselves.
• Teachers can model democratic behavior by providing guidance and leadership and involving pupils in setting rules and consequences.
• All students want to belong. Their behavior is directed to belonging.
• Misbehavior is the result of their mistaken belief that it will gain them peer recognition. [It is usually a mistake to assume that misbehavior is an attack directed at the teacher.]
• Misbehavior is directed at mistaken goals: attention-getting, power-seeking, revenge, and displaying inadequacy. The trick is to identify the goal and act in ways that do not reinforce mistaken goals.
• Teachers should encourage students' efforts, but avoid praising their work [?] or character. [Others disagree.]
• Support the idea that negative consequences follow inappropriate behavior by your actions.

The next two sections spell out the Canter and Jones models in some detail. These are the two systems most in use in public schools. I have moved them to a different file in order to shorten this page.

Lists of Rules, Limit-Setting Acts, Consequences, etc.
In preparing a discipline plan, consider what your objectives are and what needs to happen for those objectives to come about. Avoid jumping directly to a solution. If you say, "I have this tool [for example, detention], that ought to work." You have locked into a single option. To a person with a new hammer, everything looks like a nail.
It is more productive to ask yourself, "I need to get John to stop talking and get to work. What options do I have?"
My workshop participants have brainstormed a number of options for each of the elements of a discipline plan: rules, positive and negative reinforcers, limit-setting acts, etc. I list many of them here--with my comments for some in brackets. I don't necessarily recommend all of them and you should only use those appropriate to your situation and that you will feel comfortable using in practice.

These two sections spell out the Canter and Jones models in some detail. These are the two systems most in use in public schools.

THE CANTER MODEL
Marlene and Lee Canter have developed a discipline model based on thousands of hours observing teachers in the classroom. What they have included in their model is based on what the successful teachers do. Assertive Discipline is a direct and positive approach to make it possible for the teacher to teach and the students to learn. It is based on several principles:

1. Teachers should insist on responsible behavior.
2. When teachers fail, it is typically due to poor class control. They can't teach and the kids are denied the opportunity to learn.

3. Many teachers believe that firm control is stifling and inhumane. False. Firm control maintained humanely is liberating.

4. Teachers have basic rights as educators:
   - The right to maintain an optimal setting for learning.
   - The right to expect appropriate behavior.
   - The right to expect help from administration and parents when appropriate.

5. Students have basic rights as learners:
   - The right to have teachers who help them develop by helping them limit self-destructive and inappropriate behavior.
   - The right to have appropriate support from their teachers for their appropriate behavior.
   - The right to choose how to behave with advance knowledge of the consequences that will logically and certainly follow.

6. These needs/rights and conditions are met by a discipline plan by which the teacher clearly states the expectations, consistently applies the consequences, and never violates the best interests of the pupils. Assertive discipline consists of:
   - Stating and teaching expectations early.
   - Persistence in stating expectations and wishes such as, "I need you to ..." and "I like that." ["I messages don't interfere with the pupil's positive self-esteem."You are no good, why won't you behave," does interfere.]
   - Use of a clear, calm, firm voice and eye contact.
   - Use of non-verbal gestures that support the verbal statements.
   - Influencing student behavior without threats or shouting.
   - Practicing the broken record technique [calmly repeating the message every time pupil tries to argue] rather than escalating into an argument.

7. **The assertive teacher is more effective than the nonassertive or the hostile teacher.** It is hostility and wishy-washiness of the teacher that causes confusion and psychological trauma in students, not calm, firm, consistent assertiveness. The assertive teacher is able to maintain a positive, caring, and productive climate in the classroom. A climate of care and support produces the climate for learning.

According to the Canters, the climate of positive support and care is best provided by the careful application of assertive discipline. It replaces teacher inertia and hostile behavior with firm, positive insistence.

**FIVE STEPS TO ASSERTIVE DISCIPLINE**

1. **Recognize and remove roadblocks** to assertive discipline. Most of the roadblocks have to do with negative expectations about students: they have poor health, home, personality, genes, and/or environment and, therefore, they are expected to misbehave. Problems or no problems, no child should be permitted to behave in a manner that is self-destructive or violates the rights of peers or of the teacher. Recognize that the teacher can influence in a positive way the behavior of all students in the class no matter what the problems. To do this, remember that:
   - All students need limits, and teachers have the right to set them. Teachers are admired who have high expectations, set high standards, and stick to them.
   - Teachers have the right to ask for and receive back-up help from parents, principals, and other school personnel.
We can't always treat all students exactly alike. Some students may have to be given special incentive programs or behavior modification programs before they can live up to the standards expected.

2. **Practice the use of assertive response styles.** The Canters differentiate among three response styles: nonassertive, hostile, and assertive.
   - Nonassertive teachers typically feel it is wrong to place demands on students, fail to establish clear standards of behavior, and if they do, they fail to back up their words with appropriate actions. They are passive.
   - Hostile teachers typically use an aversive approach characterized by shouting, threats and sarcasm. Both hostile and nonassertive teachers are in violation of the student rights cited above. Both styles should be eliminated.
   - Assertive teachers make their expectations clearly known to students, parents, and administrators. They calmly insist that students comply with those expectations. They back up their words with reasonable actions. When students choose to comply with teacher guidance, they receive positive benefits. When they choose to behave in unacceptable ways, the teacher follows through with consequences that reasonably accompany the misbehavior.
     Example: **Nonassertive**: "Please try to stop fighting." **Hostile**: "You are acting like disgusting savages again!" **Assertive**: "We do not fight. Sit down until you cool off." [and then we will discuss the consequence (if appropriate).]
   - The assertive teacher calmly, firmly, and clearly communicates the teacher's disapproval of the behavior, followed by a statement of what the student is to do.

3. **Learning to set limits.** No matter what the activity, in order to be assertive, you need to be aware of what behaviors you want and need from the students. Think in terms of what you want students to do, e.g., take turns, not shouting out, starting to work on time, listening to another who is speaking. Instruct the students about what behavior is desired at the beginning of an activity. Specify what is desired. "Be nice" and "work hard" are not specific. **The expectations should be so clear that any student can instruct a newcomer** as to how they are to behave at any time.
   - Be sure to praise good behavior more frequently than you apply negative consequences to bad behavior.
   - Teacher responses need to be appropriate--for most students, verbal acknowledgement is enough, for some situations tangible rewards or special privileges may be necessary to motivate the continuance of desired behavior. Secondary students usually don't like to be singled out for praise--for them, the teacher will need to find more appropriate ways such as knowing looks, comments on papers, private conferences, etc.
   - Teachers should not ignore inappropriate behavior. They should stop it with a firm reminder of what is expected. They should decide in advance how they will handle a given situation.
     - Eye contact is essential if the message is to have full impact--but don't insist that the student continue to meet your eyes since that is contrary to custom in some cultures.
     - Use of the student's name is effective--especially if the message is being directed across the room.
     - The broken record ploy is effective [when the student makes excuses, argues, etc., calmly restate the original direction as many times as necessary--used only when students refuse to listen, persist in responding
inappropriately, or refuse to take responsibility for their own behavior. Preface your repetitions with, "That's not the point...," or "I understand, but ...." Use broken record a maximum of three times. After the third time, follow through with an appropriate consequence if necessary].

4. Learning to follow through on limits. Limits are the positive demands you have made on students. Take the appropriate action when students either refuse to meet the demands or act in compliance with the demands. Either response requires follow-through. In the first case, the natural, undesirable consequences would be invoked. In the second, the natural desirable consequences should be invoked. Make promises, not threats. Establish the criteria for consequences in advance. Select appropriate consequences in advance. Practice verbal responses.

5. **Implementing a system of positive assertions.** Much of what has gone before is negative. Rules and limits. This is only one side of the discipline picture. The other side is the positive one. When systematic attention is given to pupils who behave appropriately,
   - Your influence with students increases.
   - The amount of problem behavior decreases.
   - The classroom environment becomes more positive.

What are some of the positive consequences that so motivate students?

1. Personal attention from the teacher--greetings, short talks, compliments, acknowledgements, smiles, and friendly eye contact.
2. Positive notes/phone calls to parents.
3. Special awards--from comments on papers to certificates.
4. Special privileges--five extra minutes of a desired activity for the whole class, choosing a friend with whom to work.
5. Material rewards--posters, school pencils, popcorn.
6. Home rewards--in collaboration with parents, privileges can be extended at home.
   - Completing homework can earn extra TV time. Reading a book can earn a favorite meal.

**SUMMARY**
The Canter model emphasizes
- Stating rules/expectations clearly,
- Applying positive consequences when expectations are met and negative consequences when they are not met, and
- Being assertive rather than passive or hostile.

**THE FRED JONES MODEL**
Frederick H. Jones is director of the Classroom Management Training Program which develops and promotes procedures for improving teacher effectiveness. The emphasis is on learner motivation and classroom behavior. His model is based on extensive observation of classroom teachers and student behavior. Teachers find the model is easy to understand because it is a refinement of the practices of effective teachers into a system.

1. About 50% of classroom time is lost due to student misbehavior and being off task. 80% of lost time is due to talking without permission.
19% is lost to daydreaming, out of seat, making noises, etc.
1% is lost to more serious misbehavior.

2. Most of lost time can be avoided by systematically employing effective body language, incentive systems, and efficient individual help.

3. Effective body language [limit setting acts] causes students to stop misbehavior without being costly in teacher time: eye contact, facial expression [calm, no nonsense look], posture [first step in "moving in"], signals and gestures, and physical proximity. Effective nonverbal acts typically stop misbehavior and avoid verbal confrontation.

4. Incentive systems motivate students to start doing the right thing, maintain on-task behavior, and behave properly. An incentive is something the teacher can provide that students like so much that in order to get it they will work throughout the period/week/month. Incentives such as stars, being dismissed first, having work displayed, grades, etc. motivate only the achievers. Preferred activity time [PAT] can provide incentives for the entire class. [Incentive systems are designed to build student cooperation so efficiently that almost any student will do as requested with a minimum of teacher effort.]

5. Positive instructional support. Students are motivated to complete work when teachers are able to move quickly from pupil to pupil [praise, prompt, and leave] and provide help efficiently [Visual Instruction Plans (VIPs)].

6. Back-up Systems. A series of responses the teacher can call upon after the above fails. If some students continue to misbehave after being presented with appropriate instruction, well-planned and delivered, with immediate response to off-task behavior with limit setting acts, an incentive system, and positive instructional support, then what to do? It is important that the teacher plan...and be prepared to use...in increasingly severe order--a sequence of consequences administered within the classroom and a back-up system outside the classroom. The implementation of the plan sequentially to the point at which students are back on task insures minimum loss of instructional time. The knowledge of what to do next...if what you are doing doesn't work...instills confidence that you can gain control without getting upset.

7. Setting the stage. There a number of things that the teacher should do to manage a classroom effectively. These include:
   a. Set up the room to facilitate learning and movement.
   b. Talk to parents to gain their support at the start of the semester.
   c. Be aware of the nature of classroom disruptions so that responses are appropriate.
   d. General rules tell what behavior the teacher expects. Rules for rules: Must be simple and clear.
      There should be very few rules and they should be posted.
      Don't make a rule unless it will be enforced every time it is broken.
   e. Operational rules describe the nuts and bolts and must be specified to provide for smooth operations [however are typically not parts of the "discipline plan" general rules].
   f. What materials to use, e.g., paper size, pencil or pen?
      What must be done to complete an assignment, when due, etc. [Performance expectations.]
When to sharpen pencils, get a drink, or go to the bathroom?
When it is appropriate to move about the classroom?
When and to whom it is appropriate to talk?
How to get help?
How and when to clean up?
How the class is dismissed?

g. Why do you need rules? Pupils want to know what they can do/get away with.
   If you don't make the rules clear, they will test the limits until your limits are reached.
   This is normal, human behavior.

h. Rules need to be taught as carefully as any other lesson.

i. Rules need to be re-taught at the beginning of an activity, after a vacation, when there is confusion.

j. Rules need to be enforced consistently, calmly and promptly. The drill sergeant approach is unnecessary and works at cross-purposes if your goal is to help pupils develop self-control.

k. [Note: There are three basically different approaches to teacher/parental discipline:
   i. Permissive [low structure]
   ii. Authoritarian [high structure, low justification]
   iii. Authoritative [high structure, high justification]
   Adolescents are most likely to follow their consciences rather than to give in to peer pressure if they grew up in an "authoritative" home...where rules are firm but clearly explained and justified...as opposed to "authoritarian"...where rules are laid down without explanation...or "permissive"...where children are able to do as they wish. This note is not from Fred Jones although it is consistent with him.
   Unfortunately, I am unable to retrieve the citation and apologize to the author.]

8. Students like classrooms to be well-managed. Disruptions that interfere with work time, upset the teacher, and cause privileges to be withdrawn tend to be unpopular.

9. A well-administered discipline plan with incentives saves time so that the content of the course can be studied more effectively. The teacher that is "too busy" to teach rules and enforce them promptly will be forever out of time.